Docket Item # 4 BAR CASE # 2007-0109

BAR Meeting June 27, 2007

ISSUE:	Re-siding
APPLICANT:	Charles R. Hoof, III, by James Noel
LOCATION:	408 North Payne Street
ZONE:	RB/Residential

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of the application, with the following conditions:

- 1. That the nails not show in the installation of the siding; and
- 2. That smooth (non-simulated wood grain) siding be installed.

EXPIRATION OF APPROVALS NOTE: In accordance with Sections 10-106(B) and 10-206(B) of the Zoning Ordinance, any official Board of Architectural Review approval will expire 12 months from the date of issuance if the work is not commenced and diligently and substantially pursued by the end of that 12-month period.

**BUILDING PERMIT NOTE: Most projects approved by the Board of Architectural Review require the issuance of one or more construction permits by the Code Enforcement Bureau (<u>including signs</u>). The applicant is responsible for obtaining all necessary construction permits after receiving Board of Architectural Review approval. Contact Code Enforcement, Room 4200, City Hall, 703-838-4360 for further information.

(Insert sketch here)

I. <u>ISSUE</u>:

The applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for residing the sides and rear elevations of the dwelling at 408 North Payne Street using smooth 6" exposure HardiPlank brand fiber-cement siding. The wood siding proposed to be replaced was installed as part of an overall renovation in 2003. The existing wood siding on the front façade will remain.

II. <u>HISTORY</u>:

The two story, three bay frame house with half mansard at 408 North Payne Street was constructed as a pair with 406 North Payne Street. This pair is very similar to the pair at 402 and 404 North Payne Street. The date of construction for these properties is not certain, but is probably in the first decade of the 20th century. In 1877 there was virtually no construction on this block when it was mapped for the <u>Hopkins Atlas</u>. The area was not included in <u>Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps</u> until 1922. By that date, the block was fairly well developed and the paired houses were present. A 1908 building permit issued to William H. Peck refers to two (pairs were typically referred to as a single building in the permits of the period) frame houses with mansard roof and dimensions similar to the pairs at 402 & 404 and 406 & 408 North Payne Street (Permit #215, 8/10/08). However, as the address is simply given as North Payne between Princess and Oronoco, further research would be required to say with complete certainty that these are the houses built by Peck in 1908. A grocer and wood and coal dealer with a business located at the southeast corner of Queen and Payne Streets, Peck had numerous houses constructed in the vicinity in the years between 1902 and 1909. The rear ells on the houses appear to have been constructed contemporaneously with the main block.

In 2003 and 2004 the Board approved demolition/capsulation, additions and alterations to this house. The original plans were amended to propose a smaller project which eliminated the originally proposed and approved additions to the side and rear (BAR Case #s 2003-0095 & 0096, 6/25/2003 and 2003-0318, 1/28/04).

III. ANALYSIS:

Proposed residing complies with zoning ordinance requirements.

The existing wood siding is proposed to be replaced because it has suffered severe deterioration during the four year period since it was installed as part of the overall renovation of the house in 2004.

Staff notes that the Board approved replacement fiber cement siding on the side elevations while retaining the front façade in wood siding at the nearby townhouse at 404 North Payne Street in 2000 (BAR2000-0067, April 12, 2000).

Staff has no objection to replacement of the 2003/4 replacement siding with new HardiPlank siding on the side elevations in this instance. Such replacement is consistent with the Board's policy regarding fiber cement siding and a number of other Board approvals allowing fiber cement siding on secondary elevation while maintaining historic siding materials on the façade.

The Board's adopted policy for fiber cement is:

- 1. That fiber cement siding not be installed on an historic structure;
- 2. That historic materials should not be removed to install fiber cement siding;
- 3. That fiber cement siding replace other artificial or composite siding;
- 4. That the nails not show in the installation of the siding; and
- 5. That smooth (non-simulated wood grain) siding be installed; and
- 6. That BAR staff may administratively approve the installation of fiber cement siding on non-historic buildings (those constructed in 1975 or later).

IV. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of the application, with the following conditions:

- 1. That the nails not show in the installation of the siding; and
- 2. That smooth (non-simulated wood grain) siding be installed.

CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F- finding

Code Enforcement: No comments.

Historic Alexandria: No comments were received.