Docket Item # 3 BAR CASE # 2007-0277

BAR Meeting January 23, 2008

ISSUE: Alterations

APPLICANT: Thomas Whittaker for Fraternal Order of Eagles

LOCATION: 1015 Cameron Street

ZONE: CL/Commercial

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Staff recommends denial of the application with the further direction to the applicant to clean and repair as necessary the porch ceiling with wood replacement material.

^{**}EXPIRATION OF APPROVALS NOTE: In accordance with Sections 10-106(B) and 10-206(B) of the Zoning Ordinance, any official Board of Architectural Review approval will expire 12 months from the date of issuance if the work is not commenced and diligently and substantially pursued by the end of that 12-month period.

^{**}BUILDING PERMIT NOTE: Most projects approved by the Board of Architectural Review require the issuance of one or more construction permits by the Code Enforcement Bureau (<u>including signs</u>). The applicant is responsible for obtaining all necessary construction permits after receiving Board of Architectural Review approval. Contact Code Enforcement, Room 4200, City Hall, 703-838-4360 for

further information.



I. <u>ISSUE</u>:

The applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for alterations to the fraternal building at 1015 Cameron Street. The proposal is to replace the wood on the underside of the second story porch with vinyl material in the same pattern.

The applicant has provided an actual sample of the proposed replacement material which will be made available to members at the public hearing.

II. HISTORY:

1015 Cameron Street is a two and a half story, five bay brick building on a raised plinth that was built in 1938 as a fraternal building for the Alva Aerie of the Fraternal Order of Eagles. It was designed by D. Stafford Kelly, a certified civil engineer, and constructed by Allen Clark Minnix of Washington, DC. According to a 1938 article in the *Alexandria Gazette*, it was to be ■one of the most modern structures in Alexandria, but one designed in keeping with the colonial theme of the city. ▶ Kelly was the designer of a number of properties in the Alexandria Historic Districts in the interwar period including multi-family buildings such as the Monticello apartments in the 800 block of South Washington Street. For the most part, his designs were simple brick buildings [boxes] in a modest Federal revival design idiom.

The Board approved security lights for this building in 2002 (BAR Case #2002-0061, 4/24/2002).

III. ANALYSIS:

Proposed wainscot replacement under existing porch complies with Zoning Ordinance requirements.

A central tenet of preservation is to retain and reuse historic materials. In this instance, the underside of the porch ceiling can be repaired and damaged material replaced with wood, similar to the existing historic material. In the opinion of staff, replacement of the existing wood material with vinyl is inappropriate and is not recommended by the *Design Guidelines*. Therefore, staff recommends that the application be denied and that the applicant be directed to clean and repair as necessary the underside of the porch ceiling with appropriate wood replacement materials.

IV. <u>STAFF RECOMMENDATION</u>:

Staff recommends denial of the application with the further direction to the applicant to clean and repair as necessary the porch ceiling with wood replacement material.

CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F- finding

Code Enforcement:

- C-1 Before a building permit can be issued on any proposed future alterations, a certification is required from the owner or owner's agent that the building has been inspected by a licensed asbestos inspector for the presence of asbestos (USBC 110.3).
- C-2 Construction permits are required for this project. Plans shall accompany the permit application that fully details the construction as well as layouts and schematics of the mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems.
- C-3 New construction must comply with the current edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-4 Alterations to the existing structure must comply with the current edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-5 Alterations to the existing structure and/or installation and/or altering of equipment therein requires a building permit. Five sets of plans, bearing the signature and seal of a design professional registered in the Commonwealth of Virginia, must accompany the written application. The plans must include all dimensions, construction alterations details, kitchen equipment, electrical, plumbing, and mechanical layouts and schematics.

Historic Alexandria:

No comments received.