

Docket Item # 3  
BAR CASE # 2007-0111

BAR Meeting  
February 27, 2008

**ISSUE:** Addition & Alterations  
**APPLICANT:** Cheryl Zadlo  
**LOCATION:** 1004 Pendleton Street  
**ZONE:** CSL/Commercial

---

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

1. That the two-over-two wood windows be single glazed, true divided light on the front facade and may be double pane insulated (either one-over-one or two-over-two) on the side and rear elevations.
2. That the applicant work with staff to determine whether the existing historic siding can be repaired and retained, or if it cannot, what the most appropriate type of new wood siding would be.
3. That any new trim be constructed of wood, not synthetic Azek trim.
4. That the vertical trim board delineating the house at 1004 Pendleton Street from its neighbor be deleted.
5. That the unapproved shed be removed from the property within three months.
6. That the proposed fence not exceed 6 feet in height and that the applicant consult with staff on the design of the proposed rear fence prior to its installation.
7. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
8. The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.

9. The above Archaeology conditions 7 and 8 must appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including sheeting and shoring and grading) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirement.

(Insert sketch here)

**I. ISSUE:**

The applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness in order to construct a two story addition on the east side of the house and a screened porch with an upper level deck on the rear of the house. The applicant is also proposing a number of exterior alterations to the house, including: replacement windows throughout; new Hardiplank siding and Azek trim; a front light; replacement shutters; repair of the wood fascia and door hood; a vertical trim board to separate 1004 Pendleton Street from 1006 Pendleton Street; replacement in kind of front gate; and, a rear yard privacy fence.

Side Addition

The existing one story porch will be demolished and in its place a two story addition will be constructed. The addition will measure approximately 3.75' by 16'. It will have a flat roof to tie into the existing roof and will contain no openings.

Rear Addition

The proposed screened porch at the rear of the house will measure approximately 9' by 15.' Its roof deck will be accessed from the second floor master bedroom. One of the two windows on the second floor of the rear façade will be removed and a door will be installed. The porch door, the upper and lower railings and the screen framing will be constructed of wood. The deck floor will be constructed with a manufactured synthetic product.

Windows

The applicant proposes to remove the storm windows and replace all of the existing windows, which are primarily one-over-one wood windows, with the exception of the three original two-over-two wood windows on the second floor of the front façade. It is unclear whether the windows proposed will have a two-over-two light pattern throughout, or just on the front elevation (with the remainder of the house being one-over-one). All of the windows are proposed to be double pane insulated, and the two-over-two windows will have simulated divided lights with an interior spacer bar.

Siding/trim

The applicant proposes to re-side the entire house with Hardiplank siding and to wrap the existing trim with a product called Azek, which is a plastic building product.

Lighting

A lantern style light with a black finish will be installed to the east of the existing front door.

Shutters

The fixed aluminum shutters will be replaced with operable louvered wood shutters.

Gate/Fencing

The front gate will be replaced with a wood gate of the same design. The applicant also proposes to install an 8' wood fence in the rear yard.

Other Repairs/Alterations

The applicant also proposes to add a vertical trim board between the house and the adjoining house at 1006 Pendleton Street, and to repair the damaged wood on the fascia and door surround.

## **II. HISTORY:**

The two-story frame house at 1004 Pendleton Street appears to be a twin to the house at 1006 Pendleton Street but it was actually constructed earlier, prior to 1902, when it first appears on the Sanborn map (1006 Pendleton Street is not shown on the Sanborn maps until 1907). The house retains its original footprint, as well as its Italianate door surround and cornice, and three of the original two-over-two wood windows.

Staff located one previous Board approval for this house (BAR Case #87-0023, June 10, 1987) for the removal of safety grilles and a proposed new color scheme for the front of the house.

## **III. ANALYSIS:**

The proposed addition and alterations comply with FAR and zone regulations. On December 13, 2007, the applicant obtained a special exception from the Board of Zoning Appeals to enclose the existing one story porch and add a second story addition, and to construct a one story screened porch with a roof deck in a required side yard (BZA Case #2007-0038).

In the opinion of staff, the proposed additions are appropriate and compatible with the existing residential building at 1004 Pendleton Street, and conform to the recommendations in the *Design Guidelines* for residential additions. The two additions are relatively modest in size and are minimally visible. Staff commends the applicant for wanting to restore the property. However, staff has a number of concerns regarding the type of materials proposed for the renovation.

### Windows

The *Design Guidelines* recommend that all windows on historic properties be single glazed (1 pane of glass) with true divided lights. However, the Board has on a number of occasions permitted the use of double pane insulated windows with exterior mullions and interior spacer bars, often in less visible locations. Double insulated windows, like those proposed by the applicant, actually have a different appearance than historic windows with single glazing. Because windows are such a character-defining feature of a building, Staff recommends that at the very least the front elevation windows be two-over-two single glazed, true divided light wood windows. Should the Board feel that double pane insulated windows are appropriate on the front façade, staff would strongly encourage the retention of the two-over-two light pattern. And while staff would prefer to see the use of two-over-two windows throughout the house, it is an acceptable cost savings to use one-over-one wood windows on the remainder of the house.

### Siding/Trim

The *Design Guidelines* recommend retaining and preserving historic material whenever possible, especially when it is such a principle character defining element like siding. Staff has not yet had an opportunity to inspect the house to determine whether any historic siding exists under the aluminum siding. If original siding exists and is in good condition, staff would recommend that this be repaired and retained. If the condition of the siding is poor, staff recommends that the applicant install the same type of wood siding that was originally on the house. The applicant

should work closely with staff to determine the most appropriate course of action once the aluminum siding is removed.

While there is Board precedent for the use of Hardiplank siding on new additions, and occasionally the less visible elevations of historic buildings, the Board has never approved the use of plastic trim such as Azek on a historic building. Staff recommends that the applicant either repair the existing window trim or replace it with wood.

#### Fence/Gate

Staff has no objection to the replacement of the front gate with a wood gate of the same design. The applicant has not proposed a design for the fence in the rear yard, but has indicated that it would be constructed of wood and similar in height to the existing stockade fence (8'). Staff has no objection to a wood fence in the rear yard, provided is an appropriate design (stockade fencing is strongly discouraged in the *Design Guidelines*). The applicant should bring the proposed fence design to staff for approval prior to its installation. The fence should be no higher than 6' to comply with Zoning Ordinance requirements.

#### Shed

There is an existing shed located at the rear of the property which has not been approved by the Board. The applicant has indicated that the removal of the shed was a condition of bringing the special exception case forward to the BZA (the applicant does not meet the required open space with the shed) and will be removed shortly. Staff would expect to see the shed moved within the next three months.

#### Shutters

The windows have shutter hardware indicating that, unlike many similar houses of the period, 1004 Pendleton Street originally had shutters. Similarly, 1006 Pendleton Street also has original shutter hardware and the Board approved new shutters for this property in 2004 (BAR Case #2004-0084, May 26, 2004). Staff has no objection to the installation of shutters provided that they are louvered wood shutters which are operable and sized correctly.

#### Light

Staff has no objection to the proposed light fixture.

#### Other Repairs/Alterations

Staff commends the applicant for repairing the Italianate style door surround and cornice rather than replacing it. However, the proposed trim board proposed to separate the subject house from its neighbor is unnecessary and should be deleted from the project's scope of work.

The applicant proposes to repaint the entire house but has not provided a paint scheme (the Board does not typically review paint colors). However, staff would encourage the applicant to select a paint scheme with deep colors which is historically appropriate for houses in the Victorian period.

Staff notes the comments of Alexandria Archaeology and recommends that they be included as a condition of approval.

**IV. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**

Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

1. That the two-over-two wood windows be single glazed, true divided light on the front facade and may be double pane insulated (either one-over-one or two-over-two) on the side and rear elevations.
2. That the applicant work with staff to determine whether the existing historic siding can be repaired and retained, or if it cannot, what the most appropriate type of new wood siding would be.
3. That any new trim be constructed of wood, not synthetic Azek trim.
4. That the vertical trim board delineating the house at 1004 Pendleton Street from its neighbor be deleted.
5. That the unapproved shed be removed from the property within three months.
6. That the proposed fence not exceed 6 feet in height and that the applicant consult with staff on the design of the proposed rear fence prior to its installation.
7. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
8. The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.
9. The above Archaeology conditions 7 and 8 must appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including sheeting and shoring and grading) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirement.

CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F- finding

Code Enforcement:

- C-1 All exterior walls within 5 feet from an interior property line shall have a fire resistance rating of 1 hour, from both sides of the wall. As alternative, a 2 hour fire wall may be provided. This condition is also applicable to skylights within setback distance. Openings in exterior walls between 3 and 5 feet shall not exceed 25% of the area of the entire wall surface (This shall include bay windows). Openings shall not be permitted in exterior walls within 3 feet of an interior lot line.
- C-2 Prior to the issuance of a demolition permit or land disturbance permit, a rodent abatement plan shall be submitted to Code Enforcement that will outline the steps that will taken to prevent the spread of rodents from the construction site to the surrounding community and sewers.
- C-3 Roof drainage systems must be installed so as neither to impact upon, nor cause erosion/damage to adjacent property.
- C-4 A soils report must be submitted with the building permit application.
- C-5 New construction must comply with the current edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-6 Alterations to the existing structure must comply with the current edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-7 Construction permits are required for this project. Plans shall accompany the permit application that fully detail the construction as well as layouts and schematics of the mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems.
- C-8 Permission from adjacent property owners is required if access to the adjacent properties is required to complete the proposed construction. Otherwise, a plan shall be submitted to demonstrate the construction techniques utilized to keep construction solely on the referenced property.
- C-9 A wall location plat prepared by a land surveyor is required to be submitted to this office prior to requesting any framing inspection.

Transportation and Environmental Services:

- R1. Building permit must be approved and issued prior to issuance of any demolition permit. (TES)

Historic Alexandria:

No comments received.



Alexandria Archaeology:

- F-1 Historic maps indicate that this property is part of a block that was a Free Black Neighborhood in the 19<sup>th</sup> century. The property therefore has the potential to yield archaeological resources which could provide insight into residential life in 19<sup>th</sup>-century Alexandria.
  
- R-1 Call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
  
- R-2 The above statement must appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including sheeting and shoring and grading) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirement.