Docket Item # 3 BAR CASE # 2009-0141

BAR Meeting July 22, 2009

ISSUE:	Demolition/Encapsulation
APPLICANT:	Stephen Kulinski for Alabama Ave., LLC
LOCATION:	427 North West Street
ZONE:	RB/Residential

<u>STAFF RECOMMENDATION:</u> Staff recommends approval of the Permit to Demolish/Encapsulate as submitted.

**EXPIRATION OF APPROVALS NOTE: In accordance with Sections 10-106(B) and 10-206(B) of the Zoning Ordinance, any official Board of Architectural Review approval will expire 12 months from the date of issuance if the work is not commenced and diligently and substantially pursued by the end of that 12-month period.

**BUILDING PERMIT NOTE: Most projects approved by the Board of Architectural Review require the issuance of one or more construction permits by Building and Fire Code Administration (<u>including signs</u>). The applicant is responsible for obtaining all necessary construction permits after receiving Board of Architectural Review approval. Contact Code Administration, Room 4200, City Hall, 703-838-4360 for further information.



Note: This docket item requires a roll call vote for approval.

I. <u>ISSUE</u>:

The applicant is requesting approval of a Permit to Demolish/Encapsulate in order to construct a two story rear addition and make a number of alterations at 427 North West Street. The applicant will demolish the rear wall of the existing two story ell, an area of approximately 190 square feet, as well as nearly the entire roof structure of the house, including the chimney, in order to create higher ceiling heights in the interior of the house. The area of roof demolition will be roughly 533 square feet.

As part of the renovation project, the windows on the historic house will be replaced and, in some cases, a small amount of wall will be removed so that the size of the openings can be modified. All five windows and the door on the south elevation of the main block will be removed and the elevation will be clad with siding.

The applicant will also demolish the 324 square foot corrugated metal shed in the rear yard.

The total area of demolition measures approximately 1,047 square feet.

II. HISTORY:

Although the City's real estate assessment records indicate that the two-story, two-bay detached frame house at 427 North West Street was constructed in 1935, architectural details and map research suggests that the house was constructed at an earlier date. The house, in its current configuration, appears on the 1921 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map, the first time this area of the city was mapped. Given the very simple vernacular Victorian era details, Staff believes that the house probably dates from the early 1900s. The applicant believes that the two story ell was constructed at a later date than the front portion of the house and the different window configuration on the addition may support this. The house has been clearly altered over the years, and after having been uninhabited for a number of years, has fallen into significant disrepair.

Staff could find no record of prior BAR approvals for the subject property.

The lot on which 427 North West Street is located measures 32 feet wide by 123.42 feet deep. The applicant intends to subdivide the property in order to construct a new house on the southern half of the lot; however, at the present time, Planning & Zoning Staff has determined that this may not be feasible. Should the subdivision go forward, Staff would have no objection to the construction of a new house (it appears from map research that originally there were two lots which were consolidated at some point in the past). Any new construction would require Board review and approval – the applicant has provided a streetscape which shows a "future" house south of 427 North West Street.

The house is visible from North West Street and Oronoco Street, and the u-shaped public alley accessed off of Princess Street.

III. <u>ANALYSIS</u>:

In considering a Permit to Demolish/Capsulate, the Board must consider the following criteria set forth in the Zoning Ordinance, 10-205(B):

- 1. Is the building or structure of such architectural or historical interest that its removal would be to the detriment of the public interest?
- 2. Is the building or structure of such interest that it could be made into an historic shrine?
- 3. Is the building or structure of such old and unusual or uncommon design, texture, and material that it could not be reproduced or be reproduced only with great difficulty?
- 4. Would retention of the building or structure help preserve and protect an historic place or area of historic interest in the city?
- 5. Would retention of the building or structure promote the general welfare by maintaining and increasing real estate values, generating business, creating new positions, attracting tourists, students, writers, historians, artists, and artisans, attracting new residents, encouraging study and interest in American history, stimulating interest and study in architecture and design, educating citizens in American culture and heritage and making the city a more attractive and desirable place to live?
- 6. Would retention of the building or structure help maintain the scale and character of the neighborhood?

In the opinion of Staff, none of the criteria are met. The applicant initially considered the demolition of the entire structure, but at Staff's urging decided to retain the house. Although the area of demolition is significant, the alterations and new addition are relatively modest and will mark a significant improvement within the Parker-Gray historic district and the 400 block of North West Street. The rear ell will be largely retained because it will be bookended by the new addition. While the roof of the historic structure will be demolished, the visibility of the existing – and the new – roof will be limited because of its minimal slope. Although the *Design Guidelines* generally recommend the retention of historic chimneys because of the visual variety they provide to a building's roofline, Staff believes that after the construction of the new, higher roof and the rear addition, the chimney will no longer be visible and therefore Staff supports its demolition. Staff also has no objection to the small amount of demolition on the front façade in order to replace the existing paired windows with a more historically appropriate single window in the same size as the windows on the second floor. Staff has no objection to the demolition of the rear shed.

IV. <u>STAFF RECOMMENDATION</u>: Staff recommends approval of the Permit to Demolish/Encapsulate as submitted.

V. <u>CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS</u>

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F- finding

Code Enforcement:

- C-1 All exterior walls within 5 feet from an interior property line shall have a fire resistance rating of 1 hour, from both sides of the wall. As alternative, a 2 hour fire wall may be provided. This condition is also applicable to skylights within setback distance. Openings in exterior walls between 3 and 5 feet shall not exceed 25% of the area of the entire wall surface (This shall include bay windows). Openings shall not be permitted in exterior walls within 3 feet of an interior lot line.
- C-2 Prior to the issuance of a demolition permit or land disturbance permit, a rodent abatement plan shall be submitted to Code Enforcement that will outline the steps that will taken to prevent the spread of rodents from the construction site to the surrounding community and sewers.
- C-3 Roof drainage systems must be installed so as neither to impact upon, nor cause erosion/damage to adjacent property.
- C-4 A soils report must be submitted with the building permit application.
- C-5 New construction must comply with the current edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-6 Additions and Alterations to the existing structure must comply with the current edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-7 Additions and Alterations to the existing structure and/or installation and/or altering of equipment therein requires a building permit. Five sets of plans, bearing the signature and seal of a design professional registered in the Commonwealth of Virginia, must accompany the written application. The plans must include all dimensions, construction alterations details, kitchen equipment, electrical, plumbing, and mechanical layouts and schematics.
- C-8 Construction permits are required for this project. Plans shall accompany the permit application that fully details the construction as well as layouts and schematics of the mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems.
- C-9 Permission from adjacent property owners is required if access to the adjacent properties is required to complete the proposed construction. Otherwise, a plan shall be submitted to demonstrate the construction techniques utilized to keep construction solely on the referenced property.
- C-10 A wall location plat prepared by a land surveyor is required to be submitted to this office prior to requesting any framing inspection.

<u>Historic Alexandria:</u> No comments received.

Alexandria Archaeology:

There is low potential for significant archaeological resources to be disturbed by this project. No archaeological action is required.

Transportation & Environmental Services

R-1 The building permit must be approved and issued prior to the issuance of any permit for demolition.

VI. <u>IMAGES</u>



Figure 1: Plat.



Figure 2: Existing site photos.



Figure 4: Existing south elevation showing areas of encapsulation/demolition.



Figure 5: Existing east elevation showing areas of encapsulation/demolition.



Figure 6: Existing north elevation showing areas of encapsulation/demolition.