Docket Item # 6 BAR CASE # 2010-0031

BAR Meeting April 28, 2010

**ISSUE:** Demolition/Encapsulation

**APPLICANT:** Alabama Ave LLC by Steve Kulinski for Kulinski Group

Architects

**LOCATION:** 1026 Queen Street

**ZONE:** CL/Commercial

<u>STAFF RECOMMENDATION</u>: Staff recommends approval of the Permit to Demolish/Encapsulate with the following conditions:

- 1. That the chimney on the historic main block be retained.
- 2. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
- 3. The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection or artifact collection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.
- 4. The statements in archaeology conditions above marked with an asterisk "\*" shall appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Basement/Foundation Plans, Demolition, Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, Utilities, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements.



**Note:** This docket item requires a roll call vote.

#### I. ISSUE:

The applicant is requesting approval of a Permit to Demolish/Encapsulate in order to construct a new one and three quarter story rear addition at 1026 Queen Street. The existing one story cinderblock addition on the west and rear sides of the house which measures approximately 34 feet long, 10 feet wide and 12 feet in height will be demolished in addition to a one story wood addition off of the rear which measures 16 feet long, 10 feet wide and 12 feet in height. The existing masonry chimney will also be demolished. The total area of demolition will be approximately 433 square feet. The remaining exposed portion of the rear wall of the historic house; approximately 112 square feet will be encapsulated by the new addition as well as a majority of the rear portion of the existing gable roof from just bellow the ridgeline.

### II. HISTORY:

The City's real estate assessment records indicate that the two-story, two-bay detached frame house at 1026 Queen Street was constructed in 1830. According to City Archaeologists, tax records indicate that there were free black households on this street face in 1810, 1830 and 1850, but the exact addresses are unknown. By 1877, the G.M. Hopkins insurance map indicates that a house was present on the lot. Upon reviewing Sanborn Fire Insurance maps of the property for it's nearly two hundred year history Staff was able to conclude that the historic main block appears to be intact and date to original construction, however; both additions proposed for demolition have undergone demolition, reconstruction, and alterations.

The one story, cinderblock addition to the west of the historic house dates to the mid 20<sup>th</sup> century as verified by staff upon an in depth site visit to determine materiality in order to date the building. Staff noted the use of wire nails and Portland cement in construction, both 20<sup>th</sup> century building materials. While a one story addition of a similar foot print can be traced to the 1891 Sanborn Fire Insurance map, the existing addition was most likely constructed between 1958 and 1961, when the foot print changes slightly from one Sanborn map to the next.

The one story, frame addition to the rear of the main block dates to approximately 1902, as it first appears in its current footprint on the Sanborn Fire Insurance map of that year. The 1896 Sanborn Fire Insurance map shows a one story frame addition however, this addition was oriented to the west elevation of the main block where as the existing addition is oriented to the east elevation. The existing cinderblock portion of the frame addition dates to the mid 20<sup>th</sup> century as it first appears on the 1941 Sanborn Fire Insurance map.

Staff could find no record of any BAR approvals for the subject property.

#### III. ANALYSIS:

In considering a Permit to Demolish/Capsulate, the Board must consider the following criteria set forth in the Zoning Ordinance, Sec. 10-205(B):

- (1) Is the building or structure of such architectural or historical interest that its moving, removing, capsulating or razing would be to the detriment of the public interest?
- (2) Is the building or structure of such interest that it could be made into a historic house?
- (3) Is the building or structure of such old and unusual or uncommon design, texture and material that it could not be reproduced or be reproduced only with great difficulty?
- (4) Would retention of the building or structure help preserve and protect an historic place or area of historic interest in the city?
- (5) Would retention of the building or structure promote the general welfare by maintaining and increasing real estate values, generating business, creating new positions, attracting tourists, students, writers, historians, artists and artisans, attracting new residents, encouraging study and interest in American history, stimulating interest and study in architecture and design, educating citizens in American culture and heritage, and making the city a more attractive and desirable place in which to live?
- (6) Would retention of the building or structure help maintain the scale and character of the neighborhood?

In the opinion of Staff, none of the above criteria are met and the Permit to Demolish/Encapsulate should be granted. The two additions proposed for demolition are not original to the house, are in a state of great disrepair, and significantly detract from the appearance of the historic main block on this highly visible corner on Rt. 1. Staff does not object to the proposed encapsulation as it is necessary in order to construct an addition and brick garden wall that upon completion will be a great improvement to the property which is located on a prominent corner in the Parker-Gray historic district. The *Design Guidelines* strongly encourage the retention of existing chimneys "in situ" and recommend that they not be removed without a compelling reason or justification. As further stated in the *Design Guidelines*, "Chimneys and flues can have an important impact on the overall visual composition of a building," therefore staff would prefer to see the retention of the front chimney. Staff recommends approval of the Permit to Demolish/Encapsulate with the following conditions:

- 1. That the chimney on the historic main block be retained.
- 2. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.

- 3. The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection or artifact collection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.
- 4. The statements in archaeology conditions above marked with an asterisk "\*" shall appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Basement/Foundation Plans, Demolition, Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, Utilities, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements.

# **STAFF**:

Meredith Kizer, Historic Preservation Planner, Planning & Zoning Al Cox, City Architect, Historic Preservation Section

## V. CITY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS

Legend: C - code requirement R - recommendation S - suggestion F- finding

### Code Administration:

- C-1 All exterior walls within 5 feet from an interior property line shall have a fire resistance rating of 1 hour, from both sides of the wall. As alternative, a 2 hour fire wall may be provided. This condition is also applicable to skylights within setback distance. Openings in exterior walls between 3 and 5 feet shall not exceed 25% of the area of the entire wall surface (This shall include bay windows). Openings shall not be permitted in exterior walls within 3 feet of an interior lot line.
- C-2 Prior to the issuance of a demolition permit or land disturbance permit, a rodent abatement plan shall be submitted to Code Enforcement that will outline the steps that will taken to prevent the spread of rodents from the construction site to the surrounding community and sewers.
- C-3 Roof drainage systems must be installed so as neither to impact upon, nor cause erosion/damage to adjacent property.
- C-4 A soils report must be submitted with the building permit application.
- C-5 Additions and Alterations to the existing structure must comply with the 2006 edition of the Uniform Statewide Building Code (USBC).
- C-6 Additions and Alterations to the existing structure and/or installation and/or altering of equipment therein requires a building permit. Five sets of plans, bearing the signature and seal of a design professional registered in the Commonwealth of Virginia, must accompany the written application. The plans must include all dimensions, construction alterations details, kitchen equipment, electrical, plumbing, and mechanical layouts and schematics.
- C-7 Construction permits are required for this project. Plans shall accompany the permit application that fully details the construction as well as layouts and schematics of the mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems.
- C-8 Permission from adjacent property owners is required if access to the adjacent properties is required to complete the proposed construction. Otherwise, a plan shall be submitted to demonstrate the construction techniques utilized to keep construction solely on the referenced property.
- C-9 A wall location plat prepared by a land surveyor is required to be submitted to this office prior to requesting any framing inspection.

C-10 A Certificate of occupancy shall be obtained prior to any occupancy of the building or portion thereof, in accordance with USBC 116.1.

### Historic Alexandria:

R-1 Approve.

#### Alexandria Archaeology:

- F-1 Tax records indicate that there were free black households on this street face in 1810, 1830 and 1850, but the exact addresses are unknown. By 1877, the G.M. Hopkins insurance map indicates that a house was present on the lot. The property therefore has the potential to yield archaeological resources which could provide insight into domestic activities in 19<sup>th</sup>-century Alexandria, perhaps relating to African Americans.
- R-1 The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
- R-2 The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection or artifact collection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.
- R-3 The statements in archaeology conditions above marked with an asterisk "\*" shall appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Basement/Foundation Plans, Demolition, Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, Utilities, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements.

#### Transportation and Environmental Services

R-1 The building permit must be approved and issued prior to the issuance of any permit for demolition. (T&ES)

# VI. <u>IMAGES</u>



Figure 1. Demolition Plan